



Proper Civil Service Recruitment is Prerequisite for Effective Civil Service Training at BPATC : A Study

GOLAM MOSTAKIM

Deputy Secretary (Project Director)

Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre Savar, Dhaka.

Contents

Chapter 1

•	Page
Introduction	3
Aims and Objectives of the Study	9
Research Methodology	10
Scope of the Study	10
Rationale of the Study	11
Beneficiaries of the Study	12
Chapter 2	
Public Administration in Bangladesh	13
Civil Service Recruitment in Bangladesh	15
Recruitment and Training in Bangladesh	16
Chapter 3	
Literature review on best practice in recruitment	17
Chapter 4	
Suggestions and recommendations	36
Chapter 5	
clusion	38
	Introduction Aims and Objectives of the Study Research Methodology Scope of the Study Rationale of the Study Beneficiaries of the Study Chapter 2 Public Administration in Bangladesh Civil Service Recruitment in Bangladesh Recruitment and Training in Bangladesh Chapter 3 Literature review on best practice in recruitment Chapter 4 Suggestions and recommendations

Preface

It is a general opinion in the country that the present administration is not in a position to fulfil the expectations of the people of Bangladesh. There are may reasons for this situation. One of the reasons is said to be the not maintaining the proper civil service recruitment procedures in Bangladesh just after independence in 1971. The newly established Public Service Commission could not select the candidates neutrally and properly due to many constraints.

There is a saying in English, "As you sow, so you reap." If the selection of players for a team is not proper, neutral and just, it is hardly expected that the team will perform efficiently Moreover, it is also true that the strength of a chain lies in its weakest ring. So bad performance by a single member of Bangladesh Civil Service can eventually tarnish the image of whole of bureaucracy.

Recruitment and training always play a very vital role in the civil service system everywhere in the world. These two factors are complementary to each other. Effective and meaningful training is only possible when the trainee officers are properly recruited.

I am grateful to Mr. Mosharaf Hossain, MDS (Research and Consistency) who has been very nice and kind to me. Because submission of the research report has been overdue. Mr. Md. Monjurul Haque, Deputy Director (Research) and SM. Zobaer Enamul Karim, Senior Research Officer have been very helpful to me in many ways. I thank for their kindness and patience shown to me.

Mr. Dhirendra Chandra Das and Mrs. Shahidun Nahar Mirza have taken pains in computing my report in so short a time. As usual my wife Sanchita Mostakim has been a continuous source of inspiration for me in finishing this research report.

Dated: Dhaka

June 17, 2002

Golam Mostakim

June, 2002

Role of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre in Administrative Reforms : A Study

Golam Mostakim

Director

Introduction:

In Popular view, BPATC stands for and institution that imparts training to young officers of BCS cadres, that is, upcoming bureaucrats of the country, and its focus is confined to the government administrative aspects only. In reality it is a vast institution with multifarious activities.

The Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) was established in 1984 by a law which made the centre a statutory body. It was created by amalgamating four previous training institutes namely, Bangladesh Administrative Staff College, National Institute of Public Administration, Civil Officers' Training Academy and Staff Training Institute. The centre was established on a new concept of training the officers of all cadres at a single campus, shifting the institute from the capital to a quieter place, establishing a forum for fostering cordiality, friendship and mutual respect among the officers and inculcating new knowledge, technology and attitude. Though a new organization, BPATC has inherited a rich legacy of managerial and administrative training in the public sector.

This is the apex training institution in public administration and development management in Bangladesh.

The centre is responsible for training of the members of the Bangladesh Civil Service, other government officials, management staff of public enterprises and support staff in the public administration system. The centre is also authorized to offer training courses for the private sector.

The centre conducts research and case studies on problems relating to administration and development issues, publishes journals, periodicals and books, and provides consultancy services to the government in the areas of administration and development.

The headquarters of the BPATC is located at Savar about 28 km north west of Dhaka city. The BPATC has four regional centres called Regional Public Administration Training Centre (RPATC), located at Dhaka, Chittagong, Rajshahi and Khulna.

Organizational Structure: The centre is headed by the Rector who is a permanent Secretary to the government.

The centre has five divisions, namely (i) Management and Public Administration, (ii) Development and Economics, (iii) Programme and Studies, (iv) Research and Consultancy and (v) Regional Centres and Development Projects.

Each division is headed by a Member Directing Staff (MDS) who is of the rank of a Joint Secretary to the government. Each division consists of a number of departments headed by a Director of the rank of a Deputy Secretary to the government. The Faculty of the centre is composed of professionals in various disciplines and members of different cadres of the Bangladesh Civil Service.

Officers of different cadres with varied field experiences are deputed to BPATC for a term of 3 years or more. These officers along with BPATC's won staff constitute the instructional staff for the training courses. Trainee officers are thus benefited from updated field situation provided by officers on deputation which is strengthened and reinforced by conceptual framework provided by the BPATC's won staff. Thus training situation of BPATC becomes a melting pot of theory and practice.

Management of the Centre: The Bangladesh Public Administration training Centre enjoys considerable financial and administrative autonomy provided by the government. The Board of Governors which is headed by a Minister gives overall policy directions to the activities of the centre. The other members of the Board are five permanent Secretaries; two Vice-Chancellors; Chairman of Public Administration Department of a University; Chairman, Federation of Chambers of Commerce and Industries; Commandant of the Defens Services Command and Staff College and two government nominees including a woman.

Functions of the Centre; The functions as laid down in the Ordinance of the BPATC are the following; i) to equip public and business executives of Bangladesh for their role in a dynamic and developing society; ii) to impart in-service training to persons in the service of the Republic and of local authorities; iii) to provide foundation training to the officers of various cadres of the Bangladesh Civil Service; iv) to provide foundation and refresher training to non-cadre officers of the government, v) to organize research and publication on public administration and development; vi) to advise the government on any specific problem of administration and development as and when referred to it, vii) to prescribe courses on training; viii) to distribute certificate to the trainees of the Centre; and ix) to do such other acts and things as may be considered necessary for carrying out the purposes for which the centre has been established.

Training Programmes: In accordance with the National Training Policy, the centre organizes (a) core training courses for career development and (b) short courses emphasizing skill development in specific areas.

The core courses are:

- (i) Foundation Training Course
- (ii) Advanced Course on Administration and Development
- (iii) Senior Staff Course

The Short Courses:

Human Relations Course for Police and Security Officers

Team building Course for Field level Officers and Public

Representatives

Short Administrative Management Course

Training of Trainers (TOT)

Course Financial Rules and Discipline Course

Computer Orientation and Application Course

Research Methodology Course

Office Management Course

Public Enterprises Management Course

Disaster management Course

GO-NGO Management Relationship Course

Environmental Management Course

Gender Analysis Course

Poverty Alleviation Course

In-country Orientation Course for International Agency Personnel.

Foundation Training Course; This Course, meant for the newly recruited officers of 29 cadres of the Bangladesh Civil Service, is mandatory for them. The duration of this course is four months. However, some special foundation training courses for two months have heen also organized by the centre.

Advanced course on Administration and Development (ACAD):
The training course on Administration and Development is for career development of mid-level government officials of the rank of Deputy Secretaries to the government and officers of the same rank working in the sector corporations. Duration of this course is three months. This includes a study tour for a maximum period of fifteen days to some countries region. But now the duration is only for two months and a half because the study tour is not arranged due to fund

Senior Staff Course: Senior level officers of the rank of Joint Secretaries to the government and their equivalent officers from the sector corporations constitute the clientele of this cours. Duration of the course is three months. This also includes a study tour abroad for a maximum period of fifteen days. But now the duration is only for two months and a half because the study tour is not arranged due to fund constraints. Each Senior Staff Course is organized around a central theme relevant to a development policy of the governemt.

The Regional Training Centres organize training programmes for the support staff in the public service. Tailored courses are also offered by the RPATCs. The types of courses held at RPATCs are as follows:

Office Supervisory Course
Conversion course in Shorthand and typing
Induction Course
Special Course for Bench Clerks

constraints.

Office Management Course

Maintenance of Office Equipment Course

Conduct and Discipline Course

Special Course for Tahsilders

Records Management Course

Financial Management Course

Bill Preparation and Maintenance Course

Training of Trainers (TOT) Course

Communication Course

Refresher Course

Human Relations Course.

2. Aims and objectives of the study:

The present study relates to recruitment in Bangladesh Civil Service and its connection with the training imparted to the cadre service officials of Bangladesh. The aims and objectives of the study are:

- (i) to study the genesis of civil service recruitment with reference to Bangladesh Civil Service.
- (ii) to explore the recruitment system for the civil service personnel, find the existing problems and offer suggestions for its improvement.
- (iii) to study the relationship of recruitment and the effectiveness of training at BPATC.
- (iv) to offer pragmatic and probable recommendations for reforming the Bangladesh Civil Service in general and the recruitment procedures in particular and its effectiveness with the training imparted at BPATC.

3. Research Methodology.

Methodology of the study will be as follows:

- (i) Personal interviews will be made has been the practitioners of public administration, academicians including the officers of the Ministry of Establishment, Cabinet Division and Public Service Commission.
- (ii) Questionnaires have been used to collect relevant data from the officers of the concerned Ministries, Departments and Public Service Commission.
- (iii) The evaluation reports made by the trainees of the three core courses of the Centre have been studied.
- (iv) The relevant books, journals, government publications of home and abroad will also be used to get the necessary information for writing the dissertation.
- (v) Literature review on the best and practice in recruitment will be made and compared with the same in Bangladesh.

4. Scope of the Study:

The scope of the study will be limited to the present recruitment system of Bangladesh along with other relevant factors hindering the proper and standard selection process of civil service personnel.

The role of BPATC in imparting training to the cadre officials will be discussed along with its cooperation with Public Service Commission, and Ministry of Establishment.

5. Rationale of the Study

It is alleged that most of the development projects in Bangladesh are not properly implemented in time due to lack of proper training and competence among the civil servants that are mainly responsible for the purpose. Recruitment of the civil servants in time and proper professional training can enhance their capacity to perform duties as required.

The morale, efficiency and integrity of the civil servants in Bangladesh are still regarded as the medium of initiation and development in the fields of science, industry, trade and commerce, education and culture. Proper study regarding the different problems of the civil service and probable solutions may make the service more effective to the betterment of the people in the country.

Nowadays no country is independent of other states. The are international trade and diplomacy. The civil servants of the respective countries take part in these international and sometimes bilateral negotiations. For this reason, the Civil Service personnel should be properly recruited and later to be equipped with proper knowledge and practical training.

Because of problems regarding recruitment in civil service personnel in Bangladesh, proper career planning for the new recruits in the service can not be made. That is one of the reasons that naturally discourages many talented young university graduates to come to the service. This, in the long run, has an adverse effect on the uniformity of standards among the civil service personnel.

In British India and also in the early years of Pakistan, civil servants were held in high esteem for their uniformity in standard, quality of services rendered by them and they enjoyed unquestioned reputation in case o honesty and integrity. But these qualities have become rare in Bangladesh Civil Service. It is alleged that compromise in the standard of recruitment procedures has led to this situation. So this is high time that some measures should be taken to inquire into the matter and offer some pragmatic suggestions.

6. The proposed study is expected to benefit the BPATC, the Public Service Commission and the Government in the following manner:

BPATC:

- (a) Will help the BPATC in asserting its role in finding our some pragmatic reform measures that may help make the training at BPATC more effective.
- (b) Will help the future Course Directors of 3 core courses to reorganise the contents of some of the modules in a more effective manner.

The Public Service Commission:

The Public Service Commission may kindly consider some of the proposed measures to make the selection procedures in order to recruit the cadre officials in a more effective manner.

The Government

Will improve the Public Service if some of the proposed reform measures for proper and better selection of civil servants are kindly considered for implementation.

Chapter-2

7. Public Administration in Bangladesh

We inherited the British system of administration through British Indian Civil Service. East India Company came to India in 1601 for commercial purpose. They introduced a well-organized Covenanted Civil Service when the Company gained ruling power after defeating the last Nawab of Bengal in 1757. The East India Company ruled this country till 1857 when the power was transferred to the Crown after the great Sepoy Mutiny. It did not affect the administration much. But the Act of 1919 introducing responsible government in British Indian Provinces, effected considerably the administration in India.

In 1947 India was partitioned to form two independent states namely Pakistan and India. East Bengal became a part of Pakistan and was renamed East Pakistan.

When Pakistan gained independence in 1947, parliamentary system of government was there and the Constitution came into force in 1956. But the Constitution was abrogated in October, 1958 when martial was promulgated. The country was under martial law from 1958 to 1962. In 1962 the new Constitution came in force. But the civil administration remained more or less the same.

Administration in Bangladesh. Bangladesh gained independence through a War of Liberation in 1971. The country naturally gained the administrative system of Pakistan and the former officers of Pakistan continued their service in the new administration of Bangladesh.

The civil administration of Bangladesh was disrupted in August 1975 when the Army took our power after a bloody coup in which the then President Sheikh Mujibur Rahman was killed along with the members of this family except his two daughters as they were then abroad.

Again there was a military coup in March, 1982 and a General ruled the country for the next 9 years. He was overthrown in December 1990 and a civil government was installed in April, 1991. The present government came to power in June 1996 through an internationally recognized democratic election and the Ruling Party set 'administrative reforms' in their Election Manifesto.

Administration in Bangladesh: Bangladesh gained through a War of Liberation in 1971. The naturally gained the administrative system of Pakistan and the former officers of Pakistan continued their service in the new administration of Bangladesh.

The civil administration of Bangladesh was disrupted in August 1975 when the Army took our power after a bloody coup in which the then President Sheikh Mujibur Rahman was killed along with the members of his family except his two daughters when were then abroad.

Again there was a military coup in March, 1982 and a General ruled the country for the next 9 years. He was overthrown in December 1990 and a government was installed in April, 1991. The present government came to power in June 1996 through an internally recognized democratic election and the Ruling Party set 'administrative reforms' in their Election Manifesto.

8. Civil Service Recruitment in Bangladesh:

In a developing country like Bangladesh the role of civil service personnel is a very important factor in achieving the national aspirations and goals. This may be done when there is a competent and modern civil service system in the country. In this regard, it may be said that Bangladesh Civil Service is burdened with almost the similar problems existing in other developing countries.

The Bangladesh Civil Service has a long tradition from the British Indian Civil Service where the most talented persons were recruited through a general and uniform competitive examination. This enabled the service structure to maintain its purest form due to various reasons.

The issues regarding the Bangladesh Civil Service are many in number. But in the proposed dissertation only on topic i.e. recruitment will be analysed in depth with probable solutions that may help minimise the ever-existing problems in Bangladesh Civil Service system.

Problem to be discussed is recruitment for the civil service personnel in the country. Proper recruitment makes the structure of the service strong and uniform. In civil services in developing countries jobs are still considered to be highly lucrative and offer comparatively better promotion prospects and security of the service.

In the private sector services, monetary gains are far better than those of the civil service. But many remedial functions are needed to retain the prestige and integrity in the civil service. It is the overall impression in the service that attracts the really talented young persons to the service and hence a chance for better services for the general mass of the country. Because in Bangladesh most of the state and social services are rendered by the government machinery. So an efficient and effective type of civil service is much needed in the country. And proper recruitment is the precondition for the purpose.

Along with public statutory corporations, the government in Bangladesh directly or indirectly controls 90% of the country's

economic activity. It is, therefore, essential that the bureaucracy is run by bright persons properly recruited. This will help maintain current development activities in the country.

9. Recruitment and Training in Bangladesh Civil Service:

It is alleged by different quarters that the training imparted at BPATC is not effective up to desired level for various reasons. Recruitment is considered as one of the reasons for the same. Since liberation in 1971 Government has not been able for unavoidable reasons to recruit its officials in a proper and effective manner. This has been considered as one of the major reasons for not making our training at BPATC effective.

The recruitment should always be made according to the capacity of the training institutes. Once, there is a "back log" of untrained officers, it remains for a long time causing enormous troubles for the Government. To minimise this "back log" duration of the training programmes is reduced and number of modules is curtailed. This tells upon standard of the officers coming through these special programmes. Government should take necessary steps not to aggravate the situation.

To bring about positive changes in Bangladesh Civil Service especially in the fields of recruitment and training there should be a "genuine political will" and the support of the senior civil servants.

CHAPTER 3

Problems in Recruitment

RECRUITMENT

10. Literature review on 'best Practice' in recruitment:

The recruitment should be to obtain the number and quality of employees at a reasonable cost to satisfy the manpower needs of the organization.

The recruitment and selection procedures consist of three stages. They are:

- (a) Defining requirements that concern the preparation of job descriptions and specifications and fixing terms and conditions of employment.
- (b) Attracting candidates are the methods like reviewing and evaluating different sources of applicants, advertising, using agencies and consultants.
- (c) Selecting candidates concerns scrutinizing application, interviewing, assessing and testing the candidates. Then the suitable candidates are offered employment. References are obtained and contracts of employment are made.

Defining Requirements

(a) To do a job description is to describe the tasks and responsibilities of which the job is made of we need to remember the following points to do a good job description.

They are:

- (i) Main purpose of job.
- (ii) Main tasks of the job mean the duties and responsibilities required to do the job.
- (iii) Scope of the job means the importance of the job.

(b) Person specification defines the qualifications, experience and person qualities required by the jobholder or any other information on the special demands of the job. It also contains terms and conditions of employment like salary, fringe benefits, hours and holidays.

Alec Ridge's Seven Point Plan and Munro Fraser's Five-Fold Grading System are used to draw up a personnel specification.

The Seven-Point Plan

- 1. Physical make-up health, appearance, bearing and speech
- 2. Attainments-education, qualifications and experience
- 3. General intelligence-intellectual capacity
- 4. Special aptitudes-mechanical, manual dexterity, facility in use of words and figures
- 5. Interests-intellectual, practical, constructional, physically active, social, artistic
- 6. Disposition- acceptability, influence over others, steadiness, dependability, self-reliance.
- 7. Circumstances-any special demands of the job, such as ability to work unsociable hours, travel abroad, etc.

The Five-Fold Grading System

- 1. Impact on others-Physical make-up, appearance, speech and manner
- 2. Acquired qualifications-education, vocational training, work experience
- 3. Innate abilities-quickness of comprehension and aptitude for learning

- 4. Motivation- individual goals, consistency and determination in following them up, success rate.
- 5. Adjustment-emotional stability, ability to stand up to stress and ability to get on with people. (ACAS, 1984, PP. 5-6).

Care should also be taken to observe the rules and conditions of the Race Relations or Sex Discrimination acts while preparing the personnel Specifications.

Attracting candidates.

This involves identifying, evaluating and using the most appropriate sources of applicants. Sometimes, it becomes necessary to study the factors that attract or repel candidates.

Sources of Candidates.

Internal Recruitment: This is a method by which the existing employees of the organization can get opportunities for development and promotion. The cost is minimum and it ensures that trained and valuable employees are retained by the organization.

Word of Mouth: The existing employees introduce their relatives and friends to the organization. Method is economical but there may be possibility of discrimination against the members of one sex or racial groups.

External advertisements: This may be done in local and national newspaper, specialist or professional journals, radio, television and cinema.

Employment agencies: It may comprise of both government and private agencies like Employment Department's Employment Service and Commercial employment agencies.

Education and Training Establishments: These may be regular sources of recruitment.

Recruitment Consultants: They may be used to carry out the job analysis, advertise and assist with the final selection.

After exploring the sources of recruitment, the design of the advertisement should be made. This may be done by looking through the advertisements in local newspapers, national daily or Sunday papers and professional journals. The test of the advertisement should be informative, heading should be large and eye-catching, give specific details such as pay and qualifications. The from of reply and closing date should be clearly stated. Moreover,

Advertisements must not discriminate on the grounds of sex race, except in specific circumstances as detailed under the relevant Discrimination Act. (IPM, 1990, P.6.)

Selecting Candidates

Sometimes the applicants are interviewed once the posts are advertised. In many cases written applications are invited. They are considered together and best candidate is selected through interview. The job is offered to the candidate who most closely meets the requirements of the organization.

Complex jobs may demand in-depth interviewing, psychological tests and group exercises. Employment records, references, certificates of qualification and accomplishment are also taken into consideration before offering the employment.

Application Forms: Application forms are used to get standard information on the applicant. This helps for interviewing the candidate and setting up personnel records when the applicant gets employment.

Selection Tests: Practical tests may be arranged when the job requires practical skills like shorthand typing. But this is not required in case of clerical or administrative posts. Candidates may be tested while participating in-group requirements should always be kept in mind in deciding selection criteria and tests.

Written Examination: Written examination are used to select the candidates for many jobs especially the civil service. The candidates' knowledge is examined through a set of questions. The knowledge of the applicants and their power for expression are judged through written examination.

Psychological Tests: Intelligence, aptitudes, personality, motivation and attitudes are studied through psychological tests. The tests have generate some controversy but are used by some large organizations for many years.

References: References may help in checking factual information like job title, length of services, attendance and record. Reference should always be made with the consent of the applicant.

Interviews: Most jobs are filled through interviews where the interviewer gets and opportunity for the close contact with the candidate. There is a scope for a superficial or biased selection in case of a single interviewer. For this reason a second interview or an interviewing panel is used.

Interviewing panel: When two or three people are gathered together to interview a candidate, this is called an interviewing panel. This is a common practice in case of selection of already employed candidates for a post in an organization.

There is a scope for discussion among the interviewers of their joint impression of the candidate's behaviour at the interview. Any superficial judgements may be modified or enlarged through mutual discussions and consent among the interviewers.

Selection Boards: Selection boards are formed when there are a number of parties involved in the selection decision. Selection boards have both advantages and disadvantages. The interviewing members can have a chance to compare notes and look at the applicants from different points of view.

Sometimes decisions may be prejudiced by a dominating member and the question may be unplanned and may lose the sequence. The candidates hardly get an opportunity to expand themselves. The boards may make mistakes in selecting the candidates.

Civil Service Recruitment in Britain.

In many countries Civil Service offers job for a lifetime of a candidate and the job is permanent by nature. Selection and recruitment of the civil servants vary from one country to another. In Britain, France and in many other developing countries the civil servants are permanently engaged and professional by nature.

But in the United States of America the top civil servants of almost all departments come with the newly elected President and go with him. This is one of the striking characteristics of United States Civil Service.

Peter du Sautoy writes:

The basic principle of the modern British civil service system is the recruitment of its members as a result of open competition in which merit is the sole deciding factor. This system originates from the famous Trevelyan Report of a hundred years ago which recommended the recruitment of the civil service by competition rather than patronage and contemplated an efficient body of permanent officers duly subordinate to the Ministers responsible to the Crown and the Parliament. (Sautoy, P. du, 1957, P. 45).

The Civil Service Commission was set up on 21 May 1885 by order in the Council. The Commission supervised the recruitment of new entrants to the service by open competition and to achieve the objects of abolition of patronage and attracting the best talents of the country necessary examination were introduced.

Now-a-days, the Civil Service Commission has a board of eminent civil servants and their staff who recruit centrally all permanent staff using the methods of written examination or interview only or both together.

Many countries have copied this method especially the former colonies of the British Empire. The British system has been adopted by some other countries. The selection procedure is designed to appoint the best persons without political pressure or favoritism. In order to ensure the security of tenure so that the civil servants can function without fear they must be the best people available in the country.

In addition justice must not only be done, it must be seen to be done. Hence the importance of a clearly defined qualifications for a post which can be publicly advertised. Everyone can then see what is required of a new civil servant; qualifications must be made quite plain to all, so that there can be no suspicion of nepotism. The posts must also be advertised as widely as possible so that everyone who is qualified may have a chance to apply (Sautoy, P. du, 1957, pp.46-47).

To ensure that the best people are selected for the post, the same should be achieved by public advertisement. After advertising for the post, there is a list of qualified candidates from which selection is made.

There are various methods of selection. When there is a limited number of applicants the selection may be done through interview only. But when there is a possibility of a large number, a special examination may be arranged to screen out the less brilliant.

From the Second World War years the 'house party' of selection has been used. This is a method in which the candidates are tested psychologically and in practical action. They may be given a file and then may act as chairman of a committee deciding action on the contents of the file.

Written examination is used for selection in some cases. In order to judge the suitability of the academically advanced candidates, an interview board generally examines them through oral questions and answers.

Fresh graduates from the universities are selected for the administrative class which is the most important section of the service. There is a provision for promotion into this class from the lower grades,

but the bulk of recruitment is direct from the universities after examination and interview. (Sautoy, P. du, 1957, p. 48).

In recent years, a number of graduates who have been successful in the open competition for the administrative class finally decided to join the ranks of university teachers rather than the civil service (Sautoy, P. du, 1957, p. 49).

There is no bias for any subject for entering the Civil service in Britain. In the nineteenth century graduates with classical education were favoured for civil service. On the contrary, in the States the upper ranks of the public servants are more drawn from the legal profession and in France the degree in law often gives some advantage in appointment to the civil service.

Selection for established posts in the Civil Service is by written examination, by interview before a Selection Board, by objective or aptitude tests, or by extended tests and interviews (commonly if inaccurately termed ``Group Selection`` tests) lasting some two days, or by a combination of these methods. Whatever method is employed the aim is the same: to assess each candidate's intellectual ability, personality, potentiality and where relevant, his professional and technical skill in relation to the requirements of the post to be filled, and to recommend for appointment those considered suitable (The Civil Service Commission, 1968, p. 297).

Posts in the British Civil Service are broadly divided into four classes. They are:

- 1) The administrative Class,
- 2) The Executive Class,
- 3) The Clerical and
- 4) Scientific, Professional and Technical posts.

The Fulton Report of 1968 explained the procedures for selection of the civil service personnel.

The Administrative Class. Candidates at Assistant Principal level are to qualify in a written examination in general subjects. They are then to face Final Interview Board and written papers in optional academic subjects at honors degree level are taken into consideration. This system is termed as Method 1.

The candidates are also selected by tests and interviews at the Civil Service Selection Board lasting two days and an interview before the Final Board.

This is Method 11. Aggregate mark for interview and academic papers determines the success in Method. I while in Method 11 mark given by the Final Selection Board is only considered for selection.

1969 saw the last appearance of the Method I competition. The Fulton Committee also called for an investigation into Method 11 was a selection system to which the Public Service can point with pride. It remains to this day the main route through which generalist graduates enter the upper reaches of the service (Drewry, G. and Butcher, T., 1991, p. 105)

The Executive Class. Candidates between the ages of seventeen and a half and twenty-four (recently raised to twenty-eight) with GCE qualifications including passes at Advanced or with equivalent qualifications are selected by interview.

The Clerical Class. Majority number of candidates are selected by the concerned departments. Candidates must have an educational qualification equivalent to Ordinary level of the General Certificate of Education.

Scientific, Professional and Technical posts. Candidates with particular scientific, professional, academic of technical qualification and sometimes-relevant practical experience are selected by interview.

Up to 1870 patronage was the method of recruitment to the civil service. As mentioned earlier the Civil Service Commission was established in 1855 but:

it was not until 1870 that it was politically, and administratively to formally get rid of the patronage system. The passing of the Superannuating Act in 1859, which enacted that, with certain minor exceptions, no civil servant should receive a pension unless he possessed a certificate of competency from the Civil Service Commission, had greatly strengthened the position of that body and those who wished to extend its power. So it was in 1870 that the Treasury issued the famous Order in Council which both formally

abolished patronage and established the system of Open Competition (Chapman, R., 1970, p. 37).

Recently there has been a few changes in the nomenclature of the civil service. Formerly clerical assistant has been renamed to administrative assistant and clerical officer to administrative officer. Commission `s own organizational structure was also changed.

From July 1981, the number of recruitment divisions was reduced from five to four, as follows:-

- 1. The Administration Group Division, responsible to the Administration Group, including administration trainees and executive officers, and to corresponding posts in the diplomatic service and the tax inspectorate.
- 2. The Science Division, responsible for recruitment to scientific, medical, veterinary and analogous grades.
- 3. The Technology Division, concerned with recruitment of engineers, architects, value's, surveyors, petroleum specialists and their support staff.
- 4. The General Competitions Division, responsible for recruitment to other specialists, including lawyers, economists, statisticians, research officers, accountants, Linguists, information officers and museum staff (Drewry, G. and Butcher, T., 1991, p. 102).

From the mid-1960's the departments were delegated to recruit the `non-mobile` staff up to 90 per cent of annual need and some of the appointments were formally approved by the Commission.

To cut its own staff it was announced in 1981 that the practice of requirement of certificate was to be abolished for all posts below the rank of executive officer. For this step, the political patronage may play a role in the lower levels of recruitment in the British Civil Service.

Mrs. Thatcher `s administration tried to curtail the power of the Civil Service Commission by appointing senior staff from outside the civil service bypassing the Commission. But ultimately the Commission `s approval was to be taken.

Comparison of 'best practice' with practice in Bangladesh Civil Service.

Civil Service Recruitment in Bangladesh.

Recruitment of personnel to Bangladesh Civil Service is done through direct appointment, promotion and deputation of service. The Bangladesh Public Service Commission recruits two-thirds of the required number of candidates and the rest is covered by departmental promotion and deputation of service.

Bangladesh inherited two set-ups of Public Service Commission after liberation in 1971. In Dhaka the erstwhile East Pakistan Public Service Commission was functioning. Moreover, there was a branch of the Central Public Service Commission. Article 137 of the Constitution of Bangladesh which was approved on the 4th November, 1972 provided for one or more public Service Commissions and such other members as prescribed by the Constitution.

Article 140 (i) enjoined the Public Service Commission,

- (a) to conduct the tests and examinations for the selection of suitable persons for appointment to the service of the Republic;
- (b) to advise the President on any matter on which the Commission is consulted under Clause II, or on any matter connected with its functions which is referred to Commission by the President:
- (c) such other functions as may he prescribed by law" (Huq, H. A.K.M., 1986, p.78).

Bangladesh Public Service (First) Commission and Bangladesh Public Service (Second) Commission were set up by Bangladesh Public Service Commission order, 1972 (Presidential Order 34 of 1972) to select independently and neutrally suitable persons for appointment for the Republic.

Bangladesh Public Service Commission Order, 1973 (Presidential Order 25 of 1973) authorized the first Commission to recruit gazette civil services and posts under the Government in Class I and Class II Services and statutory bodies, personnel.

The second Commission was to deal with non-gazette posts under the Government and statutory bodies. In 1977, the two Public Service Commission were merged into one namely the Bangladesh Public Service Commission consisting of a Chairman and 11 members.

The Public Service Commission is said to be a constitutional body and it is supposed to act quite independently and impartially in case of recruitment and dealing with the services of the concerned personnel. But in practice, the Commission could not perform its duties from the very beginning due to the attitude of the authority.

The interim recruitment policy was announced in September 1972 and PSC was not consulted in this regard. Appointment on merit, the first and best principle in almost all the civil services recruitment in the world was compromised due to considerations of the War of Liberation.

The first interim policy was as follows:

In order to achieve more equitable representation of the people of all districts of Bangladesh in the various services and posts under the Governments (including the Defense Services) Autonomous and Semi-autonomous organizations and the Nationalized Enterprises (including Financial, Commercial and Industrial Organizations), the Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh have decided as and interim measure, to fill all future vacancies, by the candidates from all the Districts on the basis of population of the Districts. When the number of vacancies is so small that it cannot be distributed District-wise, the vacancies shall be distributed Division-wise, on the basis of population. The District/Division-wise quotas shall be calculated class-wise. (Huq, H.A.K.M., 1986, p. 79)

There is no and was no quota system in the British Civil Service.

After the War of Liberation the first group of civil servants were recruited by interview only by the Public Service (First) Commission in 1973 from among the freedom fighters with a degree qualification. Though the recruitment was done

through Public Service (First) Commission it is alleged that candidates having good relationship with the then ruling political party got preference regarding the appointment.

It is further said that a few political leaders who were close the Prime Minister exercised undue influence during the recruitment process by the Public Service (First) Commission.

The examination was resume in 1925.

Though there are many brilliant, officers in this group, they were looked down when the political party that recruited them was ousted by a military coup in 1975 and they were promoted to the rank and status of a Deputy Secretary very recently in 1992 after 19 years of service. Their promotion was due in 1983, i.e., after 10 years of service. This caused sufferings and frustrations among these civil servants.

The Public Service (First) Commission conducted a nationwide competitive examination for non-freedom fighters in 1973. Though the Commission recommended for recruitment to different branches of civil service for 70 officers, they could not be employed in the Service of the Republic till 1977 due to undue political pressure.

This to some extent tarnished the image of Public Service (First) Commission and the democratic way of recruitment by a neutral recruitment agency was questioned by the public.

This type of incident never happened in Great Britain. Here the Civil Service Commission is quite independent, neutral and powerful.

Moreover,

The Public Service Commission for the first time after liberation conducted a nationwide written examination of 1600 marks in 1977. Only 134 candidates were selected for appointment to different posts of public service of the Republic. They were appointed on probation for 2 years in 1979 and went through 22-week Foundation Training at the Civil Officers' Training Academy (COTA) at Dhaka in two batches.

In the Academy there was an internal evaluation of 300 marks comprising namely Bangladesh Studies, Governmental System and Development Economics. The

officers belonging to administration, customs and excise and narcotics and liquor Cadres had to take special training for 8 weeks on Law and Administration.

Then they were to appear at the Final Passing out Examination conducted by the Public Service Commission of 300 marks in 3 subjects they were taught in the Academy. Marks obtained out of 2200 marks (1600+300+300) would determine the inter se seniority. This system of recruitment established the reputation of the Public Service Commission.

The Commission held the competitive examination of the same standard to recruit candidates to different posts of public service in 1979. The selected candidates went through Foundation Training and Special Training on Law and Administration and had to sit for the Final Passing out Examination conducted by the Commission.

In 1982 the Public Service Commission held a competitive examination to recruit officers to 24 Cadres/sub-Cadres in Bangladesh Civil service. They were appointed in 1983. For the first time in the history of Bangladesh Civil Service, women were selected for appointment to administration and enforcement Cadres.

With the introduction of Administrative re-organization on the 7th November 1982, the lowest unit of administration, i.e., the Police Station (PS) was upgraded to Upazila (sub-district). In order to take administration to the rural masses, Upazila Court was established at the Upazila level. More magistrates were needed to run these Upazila Courts.

The Commission conducted a brief examination of 100 marks in psychological test and 200 marks in viva voce test and selected 650 magistrates. According to the advertisement their pay was fixed by their age. Though many bright and young university graduates came to the civil service through this batch, the basic principles of civil service recruitment, merit and neutrality were sacrificed during the process of recruitment.

The fixation of pay according to age cause serious administrative problems especially in the field administration. In Chittagong Division a magistrate who was more than 50 Years old refused to meet the visiting Commissioner on the ground that he was drawing more money as salary than the Commissioner. Because of the

incident and many others like this, government had to modify the rules of determining the status by pay alone.

Many of the magistrates could qualify themselves later in the traditional written competitive examination. But the selection of magistrates in this way did tarnish the image of Bangladesh Civil Service Commission built since 1979 and caused disharmony in the entire civil service.

The positive feature of this sort of appointment was that comparatively more female candidates could be selected as magistrates and this brought a change as well as problems in the magistracy. These magistrates were recruited for posting. in the rural areas. But the selected female magistrates most of whom were brought up in the cities were hardly willing to serve in the rural areas.

Later these magistrates were inducted into the administration Cadre. In course of time they are being promoted in administrative hierarchy and holding administrative jobs. This type of recruitment is not found in British or French Civil Service.

Examination of 1600 marks was replaced by the examination of 900 marks by the Public Service Commission in 1984. The Public Service Commission took the plea that more than a year was needed to finalise the results of the examination of 1600 marks.

This system of recruitment continued till very recently when the Commission introduced a Preliminary Test of 100 marks for qualifying for the written examination. The ground for taking this measure was to lessen the number of less brilliant candidates. The system continues.

The Commission's reputation suffered considerably in the last year (1991) when questions of the competitive examination were leaked out and questions of ongoing examination subjects were published the daily newspapers. It was a tragic failure on the part of the Chairman who was a retired secretary to the Government and being an engineer enjoyed the reputation as a man of honesty and integrity throughout his service career.

Recruitment through promotion.

Many officers serving in lower grades are promoted to the higher grades in course of time. In Britain there are certain rules and regulations for promotions and these are strictly observed. But in Bangladesh, changing the political regime brings good luck for some officers and bad luck for the others.

After liberation in 1971, a few Class II officers were promoted to the higher grade and most of them were absorbed in the administration Cadre. Some officers who joined the East Pakistan Civil Service Class II and were serving as Circle officers (Development) were promoted as Assistant Commissioners in 1979. They were given seniority in service who joined the service as Assistant Commissioners in 1977 causing a sort of frustration among them. Because the promoted officers were serving under them.

Some Election Officers serving as Class II officers were promoted in 1982 as Assistant Commissioners, they entry post of the administration Cadre. The posts of the Election officers were not the feeder posts for Assistant commissioner.

It is alleged that the then serving President was once a Chief Election Commissioner and by the authority of a President he showered blessings upon his former subordinates causing disharmony and frustration among the officers who were recruited to the Administration Cadre through competitive examination.

There was a hue and cry among the officers in 1982 when 134 officers of Industrial Management Service (IMS) were absorbed into the administration Cadre as the Industrial Management Service Cadre was abolished due to government policy of denationalization. These officers were employed in the nationalised enterprises and had professional training from home and abroad.

Initially these officers faced problems in discharging their magisterial duties but in course of time were given extensive training on law and administration and some of them were recently promoted as Deputy Secretary.

By 1985, almost all the Class II officers who were serving as Circle Officers (Development) and Circle Officers (Revenue) were promoted as Class I Officer as the Administrative

There was humorous saying in the country: when a civil officer retires he practices homeopathy but when an army officer retires he becomes the head of a corporation or other national institutions.

Many army officers and soldiers fought during the War of Liberation and proved their love for the country.' Many laid down their lives during the war. But, unfortunately, these army personnel were not given due respect for the heroic deeds during the Awami League regime from 1971 to 1975. Moreover, many military personnel were repatriated with the civilians from Pakistan in 1973.

Many army officers were retired with the alleged allegation that they were not faithful to Bangladesh. Otherwise, they would have fled from Pakistan and joined the War of Liberation. In fact, many officers were imprisoned in Pakistan and tortured in many ways.

A para-military force called Rakshi Bahini was formed and it was almost a parallel to the Army. There was a sharp division between the military personnel who participated during the War of Liberation and those who were repatriated from Pakistan. This caused many tragic incidents in the Bangladesh Army.

When the civilian government was ousted in a military coup in

August, 1975 and a General assumed the leadership of the country, the aggrieved army personnel came forward to take their share in the state activities namely in enforcement, foreign affairs, corporations and other state enterprises.

For many reasons many army officers were retired from service during this regime from 1975 to 1981. Many of them were absorbed in the public service and their seniority in the public service was determined considering their military service. This caused frustration and bitterness among the civil officers. But they were not united and strong enough to protest this step taken by the Military Government.

- During the political regime of 1981 to 1990 many army officers were retired. They were given top positions in the Corporations, Secretariat and made Heads of Diplomatic Missions abroad. Even a student leader was given a diplomatic assignment in a foreign country just to keep him away from the Students Movement against the Government.
- Public Service Commission, according to the Constitution of Bangladesh was supposed to be consulted in these higher appointments in the service of the Republic. But in practice it was not done so. A copy of the appointment was generally endorsed to the Commission for information.
- Some of these officers were employed on contract basis normally for three years and the contract was renewable if the concerned officer could influence the authority. Some of them were encadred in the civil service causing a permanent frustration and bitterness among the career civil servants. Many of these encadred Army Officers have learnt their job properly and been maintaining good relationship with their civilian colleagues.
- In Britain, Civil Service Commission is consulted whenever anyone is appointed on deputation to higher post. It is a principke of Civil service Superannuating Acts that:
- In Britain during the period of Mrs. Thatcher `s administration 70 appointments were made from outside the service at the level of under secretary of above between 1979 and 1985. But there was an uproar when Mr. perer Levene,

former Chairman of United Scientific Holdings was to be appointed Chied of Ministry of Defense.

The Levene appointment was subsequently criticised by both the Public Accounts Committee and the Defense Committee of the House of Commons. As a result of this row, the regulations relating to secondment have been amended, and the departments must now abide by a strict set of guidelines, and seek the Commission `s approval for such appointments, particularly those involving senior grades, (Drewry, G. and Butcher, T., 1991, p. 103)

A Classic case of disregard for established rules and regulations was shown by the authority when a directive came to the Ministry of Establishment in 1988 to appoint a certain lady to the post of a Deputy Secretary. The Establishment Secretary who was a senior member of ex C. S. P. refused politely to comply with the directive thrice in the summary sent to the President and he quoted the relevant rules.

The secretary was asked to send the summary for the fourth time. He had a reputation of being obedient to government orders and to be clear regarding rules and regulations again commented for the fourth time in the summary that the existing rules did not permit to appoint the concerned person as a Deputy Secretary.

But when the summary was sent to the President he wrote in the summary as an order;

Suggestions for improvement.

In Bangladesh the Public Service Commission is the agency for recruiting suitable persons to the different Cadres of civil service. In a developing country like Bangladesh, there are many drawbacks in the activities performed by the Commission.

Chapter 4

11. Suggestions and Recommendations

SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS RELATING TO RECRUITMENT.

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSIONS.

Public Service Commission should be allowed to act quite independently, impartially and constitutionally. The suggestions regarding, the different aspects like the appointment of Chairman, members, secretary and organogram put forward be the Administrative and Services Reorganization Committee, April, 1973 should be implemented.

The Chairman should be a person of highest integrity and honesty. Most of the members should be appointed from the civil service like the Civil Service Commission in Britain.

MANPOWER PLANNING OF DIFFERENT MINISTRIES.

Each and every Ministry and Department should have a proper manpower planing. Accurate demand for manpower should be places before the Commission in time so that necessary actions may be taken on behalf of the Commission.

ATTRACTION OF CIVIL SERVICE.

The civil service should be made more attractive to the young graduates by introducing different facilities like higher pay, housing benefits and use of transport in case of necessity: Retirement benefits and pensions should be considerably increased.

COMPETITIVE EXAMINATION AND HIGHER EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS.

There should be a close liaison between the Public Service Commission and higher educational institutions. The competitive examinations arranged by the Commission should be held every year in a fixed time so that the university examinations do not clash with those of the Commission.

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION AND THE SERVICES OF THE REPUBLIC.

No appointment to a Class 1 post should be made without the prior consultation and approval of the Commission. The system of ad-hoc appointment should be abolished. Pending of recruitment to civil service should not be declared by the Government without the approval of the Commission.

NUMBER OF RECRUITS.

The number of recruits to the different Cadres of civil service should be even every year. Sudden recruitment of a larger number of civil servants compromising the standard and setting aside the normal procedures of recruitment should be stopped.

ABSORBTION FROM OTHER SERVICES.

Absorption from other services and rehabilitation of retired and disgraced members of a specific department should be totally stopped paying heed to a very genuine and long pending demand of the civil servants.

Suggestion and Recommendations for BPATC

The following may be considered for implementation to make the training at BPATC more effective

- 1. Proper recruitment should be ensured.
- 2. Public Service Commission should be made neutral in the truest sense of the term.
- 3. Recruitment at BPATC should be proper and neutral.
- 4. Government should depute willing, efficient and effective officers to BPATC
- 5. Good posting with better promotion prospects for better training.

Chapter -5

Conclusion:

There is a saying," As you sow, so you reap. "Recruitment and Training are complementary to each other. It should be always kept in mind that only proper recruitment in Bangladesh Civil Service can ensure effective civil service training at BPATC. So every measure should be taken in this regard.

Bibliography

- 1. Fulton, Lord, (1975) The **Civil Service Vol.1** Report of the Committee 1966-68, Her Maggiesty's Stationery Office, London.
- 2. **Asian Civil Services Development and Trends** (1980). Amara Raksatya & Heinrich Siedentopf(ed) Asian and Pacific Development Centre, Kula Lumpur.
- 3. **Public Service Management Achieving Quality Performance** in the 21st Century (1998), Mazlan Ahmad(ed), National Institute of Public Administration (INTAN) Public Service.
- 4. Hamid, Tan Sri D.S.A.S Bin (1993), Improvements and Development in the Public Service, Government of Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur.
- 5. Khan, Md. Mahabbat (1998) Administrative Reforms in Bangladesh, The University Press Ltd. Dhka.
- 6. **Recruitment Handbook**, (1975), Ungerson, Bernard(ed) Biddles Ltd, Guildford, Surrey.
- 7. Christspher, Elizabeth M & Smith Larry E, (1996) Managing Recruitment, Training and Development, A Sourcebook of Activities, Viva Books Private Ltd. New Delhi.
- 8. Recruitment and Selection in the Public Service (1986), I.J. Donavan (ed), Public Personnel Association, Chicago.
- 9. A Hand book of Important Laws, Rules and Orders on Personnel and Office Administration in Bangladesh, (1984) D.S. Yusuf Hyder (compiled), Government of Bangladesh, Dhaka.
- 10. Asian Bureaucratic Systems Emergent from the British Imperial Tradition., (1966), Ralph Braibanti (ed), Duke Uninersity Press, Durham.
- 11. Ahmed, A. (1984). Bangladesh Public Administration and Senior Civil Servants, Bangladesh Administrative Staff College, Dhaka.
- 12. Advisory Conciliation and Arbitration Service, (1984). Recruitment Selection, England.

- 13. Ahmed, A. (1984). Bangladesh Public Administration and Senior Civil Servants, Bangladesh Administrative Staff College, Dhaka.
- 14. Ahmed C.M. (1969). **The Civil Service in Pakistan**, National Institute of Public Administration, Dhaka.
- 15. Ahmed, Syed Giasuddin, (1986). Public Personnel Administration in Bangladesh, The University of Dhaka, Dhaka.
- 16. Ahmed, Syed Giasuddin (1983). The Framework of Personnel Administration in Bangladesh, Administrative Science Review. Vol. xiii, No 2...
- 17. Ahmed, Syed Giasuddin (1986). Structure of Service in Bangladesh, in Career Planning in Bangladesh, BPATC, Dhaka.
- 18. Ahmed, Emajuddin, (1980). Bureaucratic Elites in segmented Economic Growth: Bangladesh and Pakistan, University Press Ltd, Dhaka.
- 19. Armstrong M 1991), A Hand book of Personnel Management Practice, Kogan Page Limited, London.
- 20. Campbell, G.A. (1955), The Civil Service in Britain, Pelican, London.
- 21. Champman, Brian (1971), **The Profession of Government**, George Allen and Unwin Ltd, London.
- 22. Champman, L. (1978) Your Disobedient Servant, Chatto and Windus, London.
- 23. Champman, R.A., (1970) **The Higher Civil Service in Britain**, Constable and Co Ltd, London.
- 24. Drewry, G. and Butcher, **T., The Civil Service Today**, Basil Blackwell Ltd, Oxford, 1991.
- 25. Fry, K.G. (1965), The Changing Civil Service, Allen and Unwin, London.
- 26. Gammon, G., (1989) The British Higher Civil Service: Recruitment and Training in Public Policy and Administration, Vol. 4, No. 1 Spring, 1989.

- 27. Helsby, Sir Lawrence, (1956) Recruitment Civil Service in The Civil Service in Britain and France., Robson, W.A.(ed), The Hogarth Press, London.
- 28. Huq, H.A.K.M. (1986) Role of the Public Service Commission in the recruitment of Personnel in Bangladesh, BPATC, Dhaka.
- 29. Institute of Personnel Management (IPM),(1990), IPM Recruitment Code, England.
- 30. Sautoy, P. du., (1957) The Civil Service, Oxford University Press, London.
- 31. Taylor, H. (1992), Public sector personnel management in three African Countries: current problems and possibilities, in Public Administration and Development Vol. 12.
- 32. Ali, AMM Shawkat, (), Aspects of Public Administration.
- 33. Bureaucracy and Development in Pakistan, Inayatullah (ed).
- 34. Ahmed, Anisuddin, (1966), Administrative Reorganisation in Pakistan. NIPA, Dhaka.
- 35. **Asian Civil Services**, Vol.1 (1980), Amara Rakasasatya and Henrich Siedentopf (ed), Asian Spacific Development Administration Centre, Kuala Lumpur.
- 36. **Asian Civil Services**, Vol.4 (1980), Amara Rakasasatya and Henrich Siedentopf (ed), Asian Spacific Development Administration Centre, Kuala Lumpur.
- 37. Smith, Mike and Rabertson, Ivan, T. (1986) The Theory and Practice of Systematic Staff Selection......
- 38. Arkey, Richard, D. (1983), Fairness in Selecting Employees, Addison Wesley, London.
- 39. Thorndike, Robert L. (1966) **Personnel Selection: Test and Measurement Techniques,** Hohn Wiley, New York.

- 40. Recruitment and Training for Public Service: Proceedings of a Seminar held on March 3, 1957, (1957) Indian Institute of Public Administration, New Delhi.
- 41. Willoughely, W. F. (1976), Principles of Public Administration, Central Book Depot, Allahabad.
- 42. Sapru, R.K., (1985), Civil Service Administration in India, Deep & Deep Publications, New Delhi.
- 43. Datar, A.B., (1994) Civil Service **A Life-Time Experience**, Har-Anand Publications, New Delhi.
- 44. Dubhashi, P.R. (1986), **Administrative Reforms**, B.R. Publishing Corporation, Delhi.